English Learners’ Long-Term K-12 Achievement in Normal Curve Equivalents (NCEs) on Standardized Tests in English Reading Compared across Seven Program Models

(Results aggregated from longitudinal studies of well-implemented, mature programs in five school districts and in California (1998-2000)

Program 1: Two-way Dual Language Education (DLE), including Content ESL
Program 2: One-way DLE, including ESL taught through academic content
Program 3: Transitional BE, including ESL taught through academic content
Program 4: Transitional BE, including ESL, both taught traditionally
Program 5: ESL taught through academic content using current approaches with no L1 use
Program 6: ESL pullout - taught by pullout from mainstream classroom with no L1 use
Program 7: Proposition 227 in California (successive 2-year quasi-longitudinal cohorts)

Elementary Gains range: 3-4 NCEs/yr
Gap closure for all programs except Proposition 227

Middle School Gains range: -1 to +4 NCEs/yr
Little/no gap closure for most programs except dual language

High School Gains range: -3 to +2 NCEs/yr
Gap increase for most programs except dual language